

# Civil Justice Subcommittee Wednesday, March 9, 2011 1:00 PM 404 HOB

Dean Cannon Speaker Eric Eisnaugle Chair

# **Committee Meeting Notice**

# HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

#### **Civil Justice Subcommittee**

| Start Date and Time:   | Wednesday, March 09, 2011 01:00 pm |
|------------------------|------------------------------------|
| End Date and Time:     | Wednesday, March 09, 2011 03:45 pm |
| Location:<br>Duration: | 404 HOB<br>2.75 hrs                |

#### Workshop on the following:

Supreme Court

#### Consideration of the following proposed committee bill(s):

PCB CVJS 11-04 -- Judicial Retention Elections PCB CVJS 11-05 -- Judicial Qualifications Commission

## NOTICE FINALIZED on 03/07/2011 16:22 by Jones.Missy

· ··· \_ \_ .

# HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES STAFF ANALYSIS

# BILL #: PCB CVJS 11-04 Judicial Retention Elections SPONSOR(S): Civil Justice Subcommittee TIED BILLS: None IDEN./SIM. BILLS: None

| REFERENCE                               | ACTION | ANALYST       | STAFF DIRECTOR or<br>BUDGET/POLICY CHIEF |
|---|--------|---------------|--|
| Orig. Comm.: Civil Justice Subcommittee |        | Billmeier LMB | Bond W3                                  |

# SUMMARY ANALYSIS

Justices of the Florida Supreme Court, judges of the district courts of appeals, circuit judges, and county judges serve six year teams. Before the expiration of each term, Supreme Court justices and judges on the district courts of appeal appear on the ballot for a retention election. If a majority of voters approve, the justice or judge is elected to another term. No Florida justice or judge has ever failed to receive a majority. Circuit and county judges compete in contested elections but circuits and counties have the option to change to the retention election system used for the appellate courts.

This joint resolution changes the retention requirements for Supreme Court justices and judges of the district courts of appeal that are on the ballot in retention elections to 60%. If a justice or judge is not approved by at least 60% of the voters in an election, a vacancy exists in the office effective at the end of the justice or judge's term. This 60% requirement will apply to circuit and county judges in any circuit or county that changes to a retention election system for selecting and retaining judges.

The proposed joint resolution appears to require a nonrecurring expense payable from the General Revenue Fund in FY 2012-13 for required advertising of the joint resolution. This joint resolution does not appear to have a fiscal impact on local governments.

The proposed joint resolution, if passed by the Legislature, would be considered by the electorate at the November, 2012, general election. A joint resolution must be passed by a three-fifths vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature.

# **FULL ANALYSIS**

# I. SUBSTANTIVE ANALYSIS

## A. EFFECT OF PROPOSED CHANGES:

# **Background**

Article V, Fla. Const., provides for four categories of justices and judges: justices of the Supreme Court and judges on the district courts of appeal, the circuit courts, and the county courts. Justices and judges serve for terms of six years.<sup>1</sup>

To become a justice of the Supreme Court or a judge on the district court of appeals, one applies to the appropriate judicial nominating commission. The judicial nominating commission selects three to six applicants and submits that list of nominees to the Governor. The Governor must select the justice or judge from that list. At the general election prior to the expiration of each term, Supreme Court justices and judges on the district courts of appeal whose terms of office are expiring appear on the ballot for a retention election. If a majority of voters approve, the justice or judge is elected to another term.<sup>2</sup> Florida enacted this system, sometimes called "merit retention," in 1972. No Florida justice or judge has ever failed to achieve a majority vote.

Circuit and county judges compete in contested elections.<sup>3</sup> If there is no opposition when a judge runs for reelection, a judge is reelected to the seat. Each judicial circuit and each county has had the option since 2000 of changing from the contested election method of selecting judges to the "merit retention" method but, thus far, no circuit or county has done so. Every circuit and county held a referendum on the issue in 2000.

#### Past Election Results

According to information gathered from the Division of Elections website, 39 supreme court justices have appeared on the ballot since 1980. All 39 were approved by a majority of the voters. Two of those justice received less than 60% of the vote. During the 2004-2010 general elections, 81 of the 88 district court of appeal judges that appeared on the ballot received more than 60% of the vote.

## Effect of Proposed Changes

This joint resolution changes the retention requirements for justices and judges that are on the ballot in retention elections from a majority to 60%. If a justice or judge is not approved by at least 60% of the voters in an election, a vacancy exists in the office effective at the end of the justice or judge's term. Vacancies are filled by a nominee appointed by the Governor from a list provided by the appropriate judicial nominating commission. The 60% retention requirement will also apply to circuit and county judges if the circuit or county changes its method of selecting judges from a direct election to a merit selection system.

## **B. SECTION DIRECTORY:**

n/a

# II. FISCAL ANALYSIS & ECONOMIC IMPACT STATEMENT

# A. FISCAL IMPACT ON STATE GOVERNMENT:

#### 1. Revenues:

<sup>2</sup> See Art. V, s. 10(a), Fla. Const.

<sup>3</sup> See Art. V, s. 10(b), Fla. Const.

STORAGE NAME: pcb04.CVJS.DOCX

DATE: 3/7/2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Art. V, ss. 10(a), 10(b)(3), Fla. Const.

None.

2. Expenditures:

Article XI, s. 5(d), Fla. Const., requires that a proposed constitutional amendment be published twice in one newspaper of general circulation in each county in which a newspaper is published prior to the election in which the voters will consider it. The Department of State has not yet analyzed this proposal to determine the estimated costs but has previously indicated the average cost to advertise a proposed constitutional amendment is \$106.14 per word.

# B. FISCAL IMPACT ON LOCAL GOVERNMENTS:

1. Revenues:

None.

2. Expenditures:

None.

C. DIRECT ECONOMIC IMPACT ON PRIVATE SECTOR:

None.

D. FISCAL COMMENTS:

None.

# **III. COMMENTS**

# A. CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES:

1. Applicability of Municipality/County Mandates Provision:

A mandates analysis is inapplicable as this bill is a proposed constitutional amendment.

2. Other:

A joint resolution must be passed by a three-fifths vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature before it can be proposed to the voters. It must be approved by 60% of the voters in order to be adopted as part of the Constitution. See Art. XI, ss. 1, 5 Fla. Const.

B. RULE-MAKING AUTHORITY:

None.

C. DRAFTING ISSUES OR OTHER COMMENTS:

None.

# IV. AMENDMENTS/ COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE CHANGES

n/a

2011 PCB CVJS 11-04 ORIGINAL House Joint Resolution 1 2 A joint resolution proposing an amendment to Section 10 of 3 Article V of the State Constitution to increase the threshold for retention elections. 4 5 6 Be It Resolved by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 7 8 That the following amendment to Section 10 of Article V of 9 the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be submitted to 10 the electors of this state for approval or rejection at the next 11 general election or at an earlier special election specifically 12 authorized by law for that purpose: ARTICLE V 13 14 Judiciary SECTION 10. Retention; election and terms.-15 16 Any justice or judge may qualify for retention by a (a) vote of the electors in the general election next preceding the 17 expiration of the justice's or judge's term in the manner 18 19 prescribed by law. If a justice or judge is ineligible or fails 20 to qualify for retention, a vacancy shall exist in that office upon the expiration of the term being served by the justice or 21 22 judge. When a justice or judge so qualifies, the ballot shall read substantially as follows: "Shall Justice (or Judge) 23 (name (name of the court) 24 of justice or judge) of the be 25 retained in office?" If at least sixty percent a majority of the qualified electors voting within the territorial jurisdiction of 26 the court vote to retain, the justice or judge shall be retained 27 28 for a term of six years. The term of the justice or judge Page 1 of 4

PCB CVJS 11-04.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

2011

V

#### PCB CVJS 11-04

#### ORIGINAL

29 retained shall commence on the first Tuesday after the first 30 Monday in January following the general election. If <u>more than</u> 31 <u>forty percent</u> a <u>majority</u> of the qualified electors voting within 32 the territorial jurisdiction of the court vote to not retain, a 33 vacancy shall exist in that office upon the expiration of the 34 term being served by the justice or judge.

(b) (1) The election of circuit judges shall be preserved notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (a) unless a majority of those voting in the jurisdiction of that circuit approves a local option to select circuit judges by merit selection and retention rather than by election. The election of circuit judges shall be by a vote of the qualified electors within the territorial jurisdiction of the court.

(2) The election of county court judges shall be preserved
notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (a) unless a
majority of those voting in the jurisdiction of that county
approves a local option to select county judges by merit
selection and retention rather than by election. The election of
county court judges shall be by a vote of the qualified electors
within the territorial jurisdiction of the court.

(3)a. A vote to exercise a local option to select circuit court judges and county court judges by merit selection and retention rather than by election shall be held in each circuit and county at the general election in the year 2000. If a vote to exercise this local option fails in a vote of the electors, such option shall not again be put to a vote of the electors of that jurisdiction until the expiration of at least two years.

#### Page 2 of 4

PCB CVJS 11-04.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

#### PCB CVJS 11-04

71

74

75

#### ORIGINAL

2011

56 b. After the year 2000, a circuit may initiate the local 57 option for merit selection and retention or the election of circuit judges, whichever is applicable, by filing with the 58 custodian of state records a petition signed by the number of 59 electors equal to at least ten percent of the votes cast in the 60 61 circuit in the last preceding election in which presidential electors were chosen. 62 c. After the year 2000, a county may initiate the local 63

option for merit selection and retention or the election of county court judges, whichever is applicable, by filing with the supervisor of elections a petition signed by the number of electors equal to at least ten percent of the votes cast in the county in the last preceding election in which presidential electors were chosen. The terms of circuit judges and judges of county courts shall be for six years.

72 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be 73 placed on the ballot:

## CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT

#### ARTICLE V, SECTION 10

INCREASING THE THRESHOLD REQUIRED TO RETAIN JUSTICES AND 76 77 JUDGES.-Proposing an amendment to the State Constitution to 78 increase the threshold required to retain justices and judges. 79 Under current law, a justice or judge appears on the ballot at the end of each term of office for a retention election. 80 If a 81 majority of the votes are cast for retention, the justice or judge continues in office, but if a majority votes not to retain 82 83 the justice or judge is removed from office at the end of the

#### Page 3 of 4

PCB CVJS 11-04.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

2011

V

## PCB CVJS 11-04

# ORIGINAL

84 term of office. This amendment changes the threshold to 60%; 85 that is, 60% or more of the votes cast would have to vote to retain in order for a justice or judge to remain in office for 86 87 another term. This provision will apply to all state court 88 appellate justices and judges, but will only apply to trial court judges in your judicial circuit or your county if your 89 90 circuit or county has approved merit selection and retention; 91 otherwise, this proposed amendment will not affect your circuit court judges or county court judges, respectively. 92

PCB CVJS 11-04.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

Page 4 of 4

PCB 11-05

# HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES STAFF ANALYSIS

BILL #: PCB CVJS 11-05 Judicial Qualifications Commission SPONSOR(S): Civil Justice Subcommittee TIED BILLS: None IDEN./SIM. BILLS: SB 1704

| REFERENCE                               | ACTION | ANALYST  | STAFF DIRECTOR or<br>BUDGET/POLICY CHIEF |
|---|--------|----------|--|
| Orig. Comm.: Civil Justice Subcommittee |        | Woodburn | Bond WB                                  |

# SUMMARY ANALYSIS

The Judicial Qualifications Commission is responsible for investigating allegations of wrongdoing by Florida justices and judges. Where appropriate, the commission recommends discipline to the Supreme Court. Nearly all records of the commission are confidential. Only if formal charges are filed are records open, and then only the records created after the filing of charges are open.

The proposed joint resolution amends the state constitution to provide that most records and proceedings of the Judicial Qualifications Commission are open to public inspection and copying once the commission has determined whether or not to file formal charges. However, records that are otherwise exempt from public disclosure will remain exempt.

This proposed joint resolution appears to require a nonrecurring expense of approximately \$200,000 payable from the General Revenue Fund in FY 2012-13 for required advertising of the proposed joint resolution. This proposed joint resolution does not appear to have a fiscal impact on local governments.

The proposed joint resolution, if passed by the Legislature, would be considered by the electorate at the November, 2012, general election. A joint resolution must be passed by a three-fifths vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature.

# **FULL ANALYSIS**

# I. SUBSTANTIVE ANALYSIS

# A. EFFECT OF PROPOSED CHANGES:

# Judicial Qualifications Commission

The Judicial Qualifications Commission (JQC) is established by art. V, s. 12 of the state constitution. The JQC is charged with investigating and recommending to the Supreme Court the discipline, including the removal from office, of any justice or judge whose conduct warrants such discipline.<sup>1</sup>

The JQC membership is comprised of:

- Two judges from the district courts of appeal (selected by the judges of the district courts of appeal).
- Two judges from the circuit courts (selected by the judges of the circuit courts).
- Two judges from the county courts (selected by the judges of the county courts).
- Four electors who are members of the Florida Bar (selected by the governing body of the Florida Bar).
- Five electors who have never held judicial office nor been members of the Florida Bar (selected by the Governor).

The members of the commission serve six year terms.<sup>2</sup> The commission is divided into two panels; an investigative panel and a hearing panel.<sup>3</sup> The investigative panel receives or initiates complaints, conducts investigations, dismisses complaints, and, upon a majority vote of the panel, submits formal charges to the hearing panel.<sup>4</sup> The process to this point is confidential.

The hearing panel receives and hears formal charges filed by the investigative panel. By majority vote, the hearing panel may recommend discipline. By a two-thirds vote, the hearing panel may recommend removal of a justice or judge or the involuntary retirement of a justice or judge for any disability that seriously interferes with the performance of judicial duties.<sup>5</sup> The Supreme Court, upon receiving the recommendation from the hearing panel, may accept, reject, or modify in whole or in part the recommendation.<sup>6</sup>

In FY 2009-2010, the Judicial Qualifications Commission received 620 complaints and filed formal charges against 6 judges.

#### Public Records Laws

The state constitution provides that all proceedings before the Judicial Qualifications Commission are confidential until formal charges against a justice or judge are filed by the investigative panel with the Clerk of the Supreme Court. Once the formal charges have been filed the proceedings before the hearing panel and before the Supreme Court are open to the public. If, however, the investigative panel votes to not pursue formal charges regarding a complaint, then the records of the complaint and investigation never become public.

Florida has a long history of open public records. Article 1, s. 24(a) of the state constitution (which is not applicable to the JQC) provides that:

- <sup>3</sup> Article V s. 12(b), Florida Constitution.
- <sup>4</sup> Id.
- <sup>5</sup> Id.

STORAGE NAME: pcb05.CVJS.DOCX

DATE: 3/7/2011

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Article V sec. 12(a)(1), Florida Constitution.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Article V sec. 12(a)(2), Florida Constitution, provides that a member's term may not exceed six years as prescribed by general law. Section 43.20, F.S., provides for six year terms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Article V s. 12(c)(1), Florida Constitution.

Every person has a right to inspect or copy any public record made or received in connection with the official business of any public body, officer, or employee of the state, or persons acting on their behalf, except with respect to records exempted pursuant to this section or specifically made confidential by this Constitution. This section specifically includes the legislative, executive, and judicial branches of government and each agency or department created thereunder; counties, municipalities and districts; and each commission, or entity created pursuant to law or this Constitution.

This openness is reflected in the laws relating to the public records of the Florida Commission on Ethics.<sup>7</sup> Similar to the JQC, the Commission on Ethics investigates allegations of wrongdoing by state officials. Unlike the JQC, however, most records of the Commission on Ethics become public records open for inspection and copying. Specifically, a record of the Commission on Ethics is open once either the complaint is dismissed or the Commission on Ethics determines that probable cause exists to conduct a formal hearing.

# Effect of the Bill

This joint resolution amends art. V, s. 12(a)(4) of the state constitution to require that most records, materials and proceedings relating to complaints and proceedings before the Judicial Qualifications Commission be open to public inspection and copying upon the determination by the JQC whether or not formal charges will be filed. However, records that are otherwise exempt from public disclosure will remain exempt.<sup>8</sup>

The effect of the amendment is that records of the Judicial Qualifications Commission would be open in a manner similar to those of the Commission on Ethics.

The joint resolution also removes outdated constitutional provisions related to the JQC.

**B. SECTION DIRECTORY:** 

n/a

# II. FISCAL ANALYSIS & ECONOMIC IMPACT STATEMENT

# A. FISCAL IMPACT ON STATE GOVERNMENT:

1. Revenues:

None.

2. Expenditures:

Article XI, s. 5(d), Fla. Const., requires that a proposed constitutional amendment must be published in one newspaper of general circulation in each county in which a newspaper is published. The Department of State has estimated that publication cost at \$106.14 per word. At 1821 words, the estimated cost is \$193,281. This nonrecurring cost would be payable from General Revenue in FY 2012-2013.

# B. FISCAL IMPACT ON LOCAL GOVERNMENTS:

1. Revenues:

None.

 $<sup>^{7}</sup>$  See s. 112.320, F.S. The Commission on Ethics was created to serve as the guardian of the standards of conduct for the officers and employees of the state, county, city and other political subdivisions of the state. The commission is similar to the JQC but instead has jurisdiction over the executive and legislative branch.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> For instance, if part of the investigation involved review of a juvenile record normally exempt from public disclosure, the exemption would remain and that part of the investigatory file would not be disclosed.

- 2. Expenditures:
- C. DIRECT ECONOMIC IMPACT ON PRIVATE SECTOR: None.
- D. FISCAL COMMENTS:

None.

# III. COMMENTS

- A. CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES:
  - 1. Applicability of Municipality/County Mandates Provision:

A mandates analysis is inapplicable as this bill is a proposed constitutional amendment.

2. Other:

None.

B. RULE-MAKING AUTHORITY:

None.

C. DRAFTING ISSUES OR OTHER COMMENTS:

This is a legislative joint resolution, which is one of the methods for proposing, approving or rejecting amendments to the Florida Constitution. The joint resolution requires passage by a three-fifths vote of the membership of each house of the Legislature. The proposed constitutional amendment must be submitted to the electors at the next general election held more than 90 days after the joint resolution is filed with the custodian of state records. If approved by sixty percent of the electors voting on the question, the proposed amendment becomes effective on the Tuesday after the first Monday in January following the election, or on such other date as may be specified in the amendment.

# IV. AMENDMENTS/ COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE CHANGES

n/a

FLORIDA HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

PCB CVJS 11-05 ORIGINAL 2011 House Joint Resolution 1 2 A joint resolution proposing an amendment to Section 12 of 3 Article V of the State Constitution to provide that 4 records, materials, and proceedings of the judicial 5 qualifications commission shall be public upon the filing 6 of formal charges or upon a finding that formal charges 7 will not be filed; providing exceptions; deleting outdated 8 provisions. 9 10 Be It Resolved by the Legislature of the State of Florida: 11 12 That the following amendment to Section 12 of Article V of 13 the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be submitted to the electors of this state for approval or rejection at the next 14 15 general election or at an earlier special election specifically 16 authorized by law for that purpose: 17 ARTICLE V 18 JUDICIARY 19 SECTION 12. Discipline; removal and retirement.-20 JUDICIAL QUALIFICATIONS COMMISSION.-A judicial (a) 21 qualifications commission is created. 22 There shall be a judicial qualifications commission (1)23 vested with jurisdiction to investigate and recommend to the 24 Supreme Court of Florida the removal from office of any justice 25 or judge whose conduct, during term of office or otherwise occurring on or after November 1, 1966, (without regard to the 26 27 effective date of this section) demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office, and to investigate and recommend the discipline 28 Page 1 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

#### PCB CVJS 11-05

#### ORIGINAL

29 of a justice or judge whose conduct, during term of office or otherwise occurring on or after November 1, 1966 (without regard 30 31 to the effective date of this section), warrants such 32 discipline. For purposes of this section, discipline is defined 33 as any or all of the following: reprimand, fine, suspension with or without pay, or lawyer discipline. The commission shall have 34 jurisdiction over justices and judges regarding allegations that 35 misconduct occurred before or during service as a justice or 36 37 judge if a complaint is made no later than one year following 38 service as a justice or judge. The commission shall have jurisdiction regarding allegations of incapacity during service 39 40 as a justice or judge. The commission shall be composed of:

a. Two judges of district courts of appeal selected by the
judges of those courts, two circuit judges selected by the
judges of the circuit courts and two judges of county courts
selected by the judges of those courts;

b. Four electors who reside in the state, who are members
of the bar of Florida, and who shall be chosen by the governing
body of the bar of Florida; and

c. Five electors who reside in the state, who have never
held judicial office or been members of the bar of Florida, and
who shall be appointed by the governor.

(2) The members of the judicial qualifications commission shall serve staggered terms, not to exceed six years, as prescribed by general law. No member of the commission except a judge shall be eligible for state judicial office while acting as a member of the commission and for a period of two years thereafter. No member of the commission shall hold office in a

# Page 2 of 9

----

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

#### PCB CVJS 11-05

#### ORIGINAL

2011

57 political party or participate in any campaign for judicial 58 office or hold public office; provided that a judge may campaign 59 for judicial office and hold that office. The commission shall 60 elect one of its members as its chairperson.

61 (3) Members of the judicial qualifications commission not
62 subject to impeachment shall be subject to removal from the
63 commission pursuant to the provisions of Article IV, Section 7,
64 Florida Constitution.

(4)

65

The commission shall adopt rules regulating its 66 (a) 67 proceedings, the filling of vacancies by the appointing 68 authorities, the disgualification of members, the rotation of members between the panels, and the temporary replacement of 69 disqualified or incapacitated members. The commission's rules, 70 71 or any part thereof, may be repealed by general law enacted by a 72 majority vote of the membership of each house of the 73 legislature, or by the supreme court, five justices concurring. 74 The commission shall have power to issue subpoenas.

75 (b) While an Until formal charges against a justice or 76 judge are filed by the investigative panel is investigating a 77 complaint, with the clerk of the supreme court of Florida all 78 proceedings by or before the commission and all records related 79 thereto shall be confidential; provided, however, upon a finding 80 of probable cause and the filing by the investigative panel with 81 said clerk of such formal charges against a justice or judge 82 such charges and all further proceedings before the commission 83 shall be public. All records, materials, and proceedings 84 related to a complaint and investigation shall be public upon

# Page 3 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

2011 PCB CVJS 11-05 ORIGINAL 85l either the filing of formal charges with the hearing panel or 86 upon a finding of the investigative panel that formal charges 87 will not be brought regarding a complaint. However, information 88 that is otherwise confidential or exempt shall retain its 89 status. This paragraph applies to all records of the commission. 90 (5) The commission shall have access to all information 91 from all executive, legislative and judicial agencies, including 92 grand juries, subject to the rules of the commission. At any time, on request of the speaker of the house of representatives 93 94 or the governor, the commission shall make available all 95 information in the possession of the commission for use in 96 consideration of impeachment or suspension, respectively. 97 PANELS.-The commission shall be divided into an (b) 98 investigative panel and a hearing panel as established by rule 99 of the commission. The investigative panel is vested with the 100 jurisdiction to receive or initiate complaints, conduct 101 investigations, dismiss complaints, and upon a vote of a simple 102 majority of the panel submit formal charges to the hearing 103 panel. The hearing panel is vested with the authority to receive 104 and hear formal charges from the investigative panel and upon a 105 two-thirds vote of the panel recommend to the supreme court the 106 removal of a justice or judge or the involuntary retirement of a 107 justice or judge for any permanent disability that seriously 108 interferes with the performance of judicial duties. Upon a 109 simple majority vote of the membership of the hearing panel, the 110 panel may recommend to the supreme court that the justice or 111 judge be subject to appropriate discipline.

112

(c) SUPREME COURT.-The supreme court shall receive

Page 4 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

#### PCB CVJS 11-05

## ORIGINAL

2011

113 recommendations from the judicial qualifications commission's 114 hearing panel.

115 (1)The supreme court may accept, reject, or modify in 116 whole or in part the findings, conclusions, and recommendations 117 of the commission and it may order that the justice or judge be 118 subjected to appropriate discipline, or be removed from office 119 with termination of compensation for willful or persistent 120 failure to perform judicial duties or for other conduct 121 unbecoming a member of the judiciary demonstrating a present 122 unfitness to hold office, or be involuntarily retired for any permanent disability that seriously interferes with the 123 124 performance of judicial duties. Malafides, scienter or moral 125 turpitude on the part of a justice or judge shall not be 126 required for removal from office of a justice or judge whose 127 conduct demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office. After 128 the filing of a formal proceeding and upon request of the 129 investigative panel, the supreme court may suspend the justice 130 or judge from office, with or without compensation, pending 131 final determination of the inquiry.

132 (2) The supreme court may award costs to the prevailing133 party.

(d) The power of removal conferred by this section shallbe both alternative and cumulative to the power of impeachment.

(e) Notwithstanding any of the foregoing provisions of
this section, if the person who is the subject of proceedings by
the judicial qualifications commission is a justice of the
supreme court of Florida all justices of such court
automatically shall be disqualified to sit as justices of such

#### Page 5 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

#### PCB CVJS 11-05

#### ORIGINAL

court with respect to all proceedings therein concerning such 141 142 person and the supreme court for such purposes shall be composed 143 of a panel consisting of the seven chief judges of the judicial circuits of the state of Florida most senior in tenure of 144 judicial office as circuit judge. For purposes of determining 145 146 seniority of such circuit judges in the event there be judges of 147 equal tenure in judicial office as circuit judge the judge or 148 judges from the lower numbered circuit or circuits shall be 149 deemed senior. In the event any such chief circuit judge is under investigation by the judicial qualifications commission or 150 151 is otherwise disqualified or unable to serve on the panel, the 152 next most senior chief circuit judge or judges shall serve in 153 place of such disgualified or disabled chief circuit judge.

154

(f) SCHEDULE TO SECTION 12.-

(1) Except to the extent inconsistent with the provisions of this section, all provisions of law and rules of court in force on the effective date of this article shall continue in effect until superseded in the manner authorized by the constitution.

160 (2) After this section becomes effective and until adopted161 by rule of the commission consistent with it:

a. The commission shall be divided, as determined by the
chairperson, into one investigative panel and one hearing panel
to meet the responsibilities set forth in this section.

165

b. The investigative panel shall be composed of:

166 1. Four judges,

167 2. Two members of the bar of Florida, and

168] 3. Three non-lawyers.

#### Page 6 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

v

2011 PCB CVJS 11-05 ORIGINAL 169 The hearing panel shall be composed of: c. 170 1. Two judges, Two members of the bar of Florida, and 1712. 172 3. Two non-lawyers. 173 Membership on the panels may rotate in a manner d. determined by the rules of the commission provided that no 174 member shall vote as a member of the investigative and hearing 175 panel on the same proceeding. 176 177 The commission shall hire separate staff for each e. 178 panel. 179 f. The members of the commission shall serve for staggered 180 terms of six years. 181 q. Repealed. The terms of office of the present members of 182 the judicial qualifications commission shall expire upon the 183 effective date of the amendments to this section approved by the legislature during the regular session of the legislature in 184 185 1996 and new members shall be appointed to serve the following 186 staggered terms: 187 1. Group I.-The terms of five members, composed of two 188 electors as set forth in s. 12(a) (1)c. of Article V, one member of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article 189 190 V, one judge from the district courts of appeal and one circuit 191 judge as set forth in s. 12(a) (1)a. of Article V, shall expire on December 31, 1998. 192 193 2. Group II.-The terms of five members, composed of one 194 elector as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, two members 195 of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article 196 V, one circuit judge and one county judge as set forth in s. Page 7 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

#### ORIGINAL

197 198

PCB CVJS 11-05

3. Group III.-The terms of five members, composed of two 199 electors as set forth in s. 12(a) (1)c. of Article V, one member 200 of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b., one judge 201 from the district courts of appeal and one county judge as set 202 forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V, shall expire on December 203 31, 2002.

12(a) (1)a. of Article V shall expire on December 31, 2000.

204 h. An appointment to fill a vacancy of the commission 205 shall be for the remainder of the term.

206 Selection of members by district courts of appeal i. 207 judges, circuit judges, and county court judges, shall be by no 208 less than a majority of the members voting at the respective 209 courts' conferences. Selection of members by the board of 210 governors of the bar of Florida shall be by no less than a 211 majority of the board.

212 i. The commission shall be entitled to recover the costs 213 of investigation and prosecution, in addition to any penalty 214 levied by the supreme court.

215 The compensation of members and referees shall be the k. 216 travel expenses or transportation and per diem allowance as 217 provided by general law.

218

219 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be 220 placed on the ballot:

221 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT 222 ARTICLE V, SECTION 12 223 OPEN RECORDS OF THE JUDICIAL QUALIFICATOINS COMMISSION .-224 Proposing an amendment to the State Constitution to provide that Page 8 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

#### PCB CVJS 11-05

#### ORIGINAL

all records, materials, and proceedings related to complaints and investigations of the judicial qualifications commission not otherwise exempt from disclosure shall be public upon the filing of formal charges against the judge or upon a determination by the commission or investigative panel that formal charges will not be filed against the judge.

231 Under current law, records, materials, and proceedings 232 relating to complaints and investigations of the judicial 233 qualifications commission do not become public unless formal 234 charges are filed against the judge. This amendment makes most 235 records, materials, and proceedings open for public inspection 236 and review once the commission makes a determination whether or 237 not to file formal charges against the judge. However, general public records exemption laws applicable to the judicial branch 238 239 will continue to apply to records of the commission. This 240 provision shall apply to all records, materials currently in 241 possession of the commission and all records, materials, and 242 proceedings subsequently created or held.

243This proposed amendment also removes outdated provisions244related to the Judicial Qualifications Commission.

Page 9 of 9

PCB CVJS 11-05.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

Supreme Court

.

FLORIDA HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

|    | PCB CVJS 11    | ORIGIN              | AL                              | 2011 |
|----|----------------|---------------------|---------------------------------|------|
| 1  |                | House Join          | t Resolution                    |      |
| 2  | A joint 1      | esolution proposir  | ng an amendment to Sections 1,  |      |
| 3  | 2, 3, 4,       | 7, 8, 9 and 11 of   | Article V, creating Section 21  |      |
| 4  | of Artic       | e V, and amending   | Section 2 of Article II,        |      |
| 5  | Section 1      | 7 of Article III,   | and Section 1 of Article IV, c  | f    |
| 6  | the State      | e Constitution to a | reate a supreme court of civil  |      |
| 7  | appeals a      | nd a supreme court  | of criminal appeals; providin   | ıg   |
| 8  | for admir      | istration of the d  | courts; providing for transitio | n    |
| 9  | from the       | supreme court.      |                                 |      |
| 10 |                |                     |                                 |      |
| 11 | Be It Resolved | l by the Legislatu  | e of the State of Florida:      |      |
| 12 |                |                     |                                 |      |
| 13 | That the       | following amendment | nts to Sections 1, 2, 3, 4, 7,  | 8,   |
| 14 | 9, 11, 12 and  | 15 of Article V, a  | and the creation of Section 21  | of   |
| 15 | Article V, of  | the State Constitu  | ition are agreed to and shall b | e    |
| 16 | submitted to t | the electors of the | s state for approval or         |      |
| 17 | rejection at t | he next general e   | ection or at an earlier specia  | 1    |
| 18 | election spec  | fically authorized  | by law for that purpose:        |      |
| 19 |                | ART                 | CLE V                           |      |
| 20 |                | Judi                | lciary                          |      |
| 21 | SECTION 2      | . CourtsThe juc     | dicial power shall be vested in | ıa   |
| 22 | supreme court  | of civil appeals,   | supreme court of criminal       |      |
| 23 | appeals, dist  | cict courts of appe | eal, circuit courts and county  |      |
| 24 | courts. No oth | ner courts may be e | established by the state, any   |      |
| 25 | political sub  | livision or any mu  | nicipality. The legislature     |      |
| 26 | shall, by gene | eral law, divide th | ne state into appellate court   |      |
| 27 | districts and  | judicial circuits   | following county lines.         |      |
| 28 | Commissions es | stablished by law,  | or administrative officers or   |      |
| 1  |                | Page                | e 1 of 33                       |      |

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

PCB CVJS 11-ORIGINAL 2011 29 bodies may be granted guasi-judicial power in matters connected 30 with the functions of their offices. The legislature may 31 establish by general law a civil traffic hearing officer system 32 for the purpose of hearing civil traffic infractions. The 33 legislature may, by general law, authorize a military courtmartial to be conducted by military judges of the Florida 34 35 National Guard, with direct appeal of a decision to the District 36 Court of Appeal, First District. 37 SECTION 2. Administration; practice and procedure.-38 The supreme court of civil appeals shall adopt rules (a) 39 for the practice and procedure in all civil court proceedings 40 and appeals. courts The supreme court of criminal appeals shall 41 adopt rules for the practice and procedure in criminal court 42 proceedings and appeals. Court rules may include rules regarding 43 including the time for seeking appellate review, the 44 administrative supervision of all courts, the transfer to the 45 court having jurisdiction of any proceeding when the 46 jurisdiction of another court has been improvidently invoked, and a requirement that no cause shall be dismissed because an 47 48 improper remedy has been sought. The supreme court of criminal 49 appeals shall adopt rules to allow the supreme court of criminal 50 appeals and the district courts of appeal to submit questions relating to military law to the federal Court of Appeals for the 51 52 Armed Forces for an advisory opinion. Rules of court may be 53 repealed by general law enacted by two-thirds vote of the 54 membership of each house of the legislature. 55 The chief justice of the supreme court of civil (b)

56 <u>appeals</u> shall be chosen by the governor with the advice and

## Page 2 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

2011 PCB CVJS 11-\_\_ ORIGINAL 57 consent of the senate a majority of the members of the court; 58 shall be the chief administrative officer of the supreme court 59 of civil appeals judicial system; and shall have the power to 60 assign justices or judges, including consenting retired justices 61 or judges, to temporary duty in any court for which the judge is 62 qualified and to delegate to a chief judge of a judicial circuit the power to assign judges for duty in that circuit. The chief 63 justice of the supreme court of criminal appeals shall be chosen 64 65 by the governor with the advice and consent of the senate and 66 shall be the chief administrative officer of the supreme court 67 of criminal appeals. 68 A chief judge for each district court of appeal shall (C) be chosen by a majority of the judges thereof or, if there is no 69 70 majority, by the chief justice. The chief judge of a district 71 court shall be responsible for the administrative supervision of 72 the district court. A chief judge in each circuit shall be chosen from 73 (d) 74 among the circuit judges as provided by supreme court rule. The 75 chief judge of a circuit shall be responsible for the administrative supervision of the circuit courts and county 76 77 courts in the his circuit. 78 (e) Administration of the court system shall be as provided 79 in general law. 80 SECTION 3. Supreme court of civil appeals; supreme court 81 of criminal appeals.-82 (a) SUPREME COURT OF CIVIL APPEALS.-(1) (a) Organization.-The supreme court of civil appeals 83 84 shall consist of five seven justices. Of the five seven Page 3 of 33 Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

|        | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|--------|--|
| 85     | justices, each appellate district shall have at least one                                      |
| 86     | justice <del>elected or</del> appointed from the district to the supreme                       |
| 87     | court of civil appeals who is a resident of the district at the                                |
| 88     | time of the original appointment <del>or election</del> . <u>Four</u> <del>Five</del> justices |
| 89     | shall constitute a quorum. The concurrence of <u>three</u> <del>four</del>                     |
| 90     | justices shall be necessary to a decision. When recusals for                                   |
| 91     | cause would prohibit the court from convening because of the                                   |
| 92     | requirements of this section, judges assigned to temporary duty                                |
| 93     | may be substituted for justices.   |
| 94     | (2) (b) Jurisdiction.—The supreme court of civil appeals                                       |
| 95     | shall have jurisdiction over the civil law, as provided in                                     |
| 96     | general law.÷  |
| 97     | (1) Shall hear appeals from final judgments of trial   |
| 98     | courts imposing the death penalty and from decisions of district                               |
| 99     | courts of appeal declaring invalid a state statute or a  |
| 100    | provision of the state constitution.   |
| 101    | (2) When provided by general law, shall hear appeals from                                      |
| 102    | final judgments entered in proceedings for the validation of                                   |
| 103    | bonds or certificates of indebtedness and shall review action of                               |
| 104    | statewide agencies relating to rates or service of utilities                                   |
| 105    | providing electric, gas, or telephone service.   |
| 106    | (3) May review any decision of a district court of appeal                                      |
| 107    | that expressly declares valid a state statute, or that expressly                               |
| 108    | construes a provision of the state or federal constitution, or                                 |
| 109    | that expressly affects a class of constitutional or state                                      |
| 110    | officers, or that expressly and directly conflicts with a                                      |
| 111    | decision of another district court of appeal or of the supreme                                 |
| 112    | court on the same question of law.   |
| I<br>( | Page 4 of 33   |

# Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|-----|--|
| 113 | (4) May review any decision of a district court of appeal        |
| 114 | that passes upon a question certified by it to be of great       |
| 115 | public importance, or that is certified by it to be in direct    |
| 116 | conflict with a decision of another district court of appeal.    |
| 117 | (5) May review any order or judgment of a trial court            |
| 118 | certified by the district court of appeal in which an appeal is  |
| 119 | pending to be of great public importance, or to have a great     |
| 120 | effect on the proper administration of justice throughout the    |
| 121 | state, and certified to require immediate resolution by the      |
| 122 | supreme court.   |
| 123 | (6) May review a question of law certified by the Supreme        |
| 124 | Court of the United States or a United States Court of Appeals   |
| 125 | which is determinative of the cause and for which there is no    |
| 126 | controlling precedent of the supreme court of Florida.           |
| 127 | (7) May issue writs of prohibition to courts and all writs       |
| 128 | necessary to the complete exercise of its jurisdiction.          |
| 129 | (8) May issue writs of mandamus and quo warranto to state        |
| 130 | officers and state agencies.                                     |
| 131 | (9) May, or any justice may, issue writs of habeas corpus        |
| 132 | returnable before the supreme court or any justice, a district   |
| 133 | court of appeal or any judge thereof, or any circuit judge.      |
| 134 | (10) Shall, when requested by the attorney general               |
| 135 | pursuant to the provisions of Section 10 of Article IV render an |
| 136 | advisory opinion of the justices, addressing issues as provided  |
| 137 | <del>by general law.</del>                                       |
| 138 | (b) SUPREME COURT OF CRIMINAL APPEALS                            |
| 139 | (1) OrganizationThe supreme court of criminal appeals            |
| 140 | shall consist of five justices. Of the five justices, each       |

Page 5 of 33

.

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|-----|--|
| 141 | appellate district shall have at least one justice appointed     |
| 142 | from the district to the supreme court of criminal appeals who   |
| 143 | is a resident of the district at the time of the original        |
| 144 | appointment. Four justices shall constitute a quorum. The        |
| 145 | concurrence of three justices shall be necessary to a decision.  |
| 146 | When recusals for cause would prohibit the court from convening  |
| 147 | because of the requirements of this section, judges assigned to  |
| 148 | temporary duty may be substituted for justices.                  |
| 149 | (2) JurisdictionThe supreme court of criminal appeals            |
| 150 | shall have jurisdiction over the criminal law, as provided in    |
| 151 | general law.   |
| 152 | (c) <u>RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN COURTS.</u>                          |
| 153 | (1) The supreme court of civil appeals and the supreme           |
| 154 | court of criminal appeals are to be separate courts of last      |
| 155 | resort, generally equal in power and dignity except as provided  |
| 156 | herein. All justices receive the same compensation. General law  |
| 157 | may provide a means by which administrative disputes between the |
| 158 | supreme courts shall be resolved.                                |
| 159 | (2) If both courts asserts jurisdiction over a particular        |
| 160 | case, the chief justice of the court of civil appeals shall      |
| 161 | decide where jurisdiction is appropriate. CLERK AND MARSHALThe   |
| 162 | supreme court shall appoint a clerk and a marshal who shall hold |
| 163 | office during the pleasure of the court and perform such duties  |
| 164 | as the court directs. Their compensation shall be fixed by       |
| 165 | general law. The marshal shall have the power to execute the     |
| 166 | process of the court throughout the state, and in any county may |
| 167 | deputize the sheriff or a deputy sheriff for such purpose.       |
| 168 | SECTION 4. District courts of appeal                             |
| I   | Page 6 of 33   |

Page 6 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

PCB CVJS 11-\_\_\_

#### ORIGINAL

(a) ORGANIZATION.—There shall be a district court of
appeal serving each appellate district. Each district court of
appeal shall consist of at least three judges. Three judges
shall consider each case and the concurrence of two shall be
necessary to a decision.

174

(b) JURISDICTION.-

175 District courts of appeal shall have jurisdiction to (1)176 hear appeals, that may be taken as a matter of right, from final 177 judgments or orders of trial courts, including those entered on 178 review of administrative action, not directly appealable to the 179 supreme court of civil appeals, the supreme court of criminal 180 appeals, or a circuit court. They may review interlocutory 181 orders in such cases to the extent provided by court rule rules 182 adopted by the supreme court.

183 (2) District courts of appeal shall have the power of
184 direct review of administrative action, as prescribed by general
185 law.

186 A district court of appeal or any judge thereof may (3) 187 issue writs of habeas corpus returnable before the court or any 188 judge thereof or before any circuit judge within the territorial jurisdiction of the court. A district court of appeal may issue 189 190 writs of mandamus, certiorari, prohibition, quo warranto, and 191 other writs necessary to the complete exercise of its 192 jurisdiction. To the extent necessary to dispose of all issues 193 in a cause properly before it, a district court of appeal may 194 exercise any of the appellate jurisdiction of the circuit 195 courts.

## Page 7 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

. V

PCB CVJS 11-\_\_

#### ORIGINAL

196 (c) CLERKS AND MARSHALS.-Each district court of appeal 197 shall appoint a clerk and a marshal who shall hold office during 198 the pleasure of the court and perform such duties as the court 199 directs. Their compensation shall be fixed by general law. The marshal shall have the power to execute the process of the court 200 201 throughout the territorial jurisdiction of the court, and in any 202 county may deputize the sheriff or a deputy sheriff for such 203 purpose.

SECTION 7. Specialized divisions.—All courts except the supreme court <u>of civil appeals or the supreme court of criminal</u> <u>appeals</u> may sit in divisions as may be established by general law. A circuit or county court may hold civil and criminal trials and hearings in any place within the territorial jurisdiction of the court as designated by the chief judge of the circuit.

211 SECTION 8. Eligibility.-No person shall be eligible for 212 office of justice or judge of any court unless the person is an 213 elector of the state and resides in the territorial jurisdiction 214 of the court. No justice or judge shall serve after attaining 215 the age of seventy years except upon temporary assignment or to 216 complete a term, one-half of which has been served. No person is 217 eligible for the office of justice of the supreme court of civil 218 appeals, justice of the supreme court of criminal appeals, or 219 judge of a district court of appeal unless the person is, and 220 has been for the preceding ten years, a member of the bar of 221 Florida. No person is eligible for the office of circuit judge 222 unless the person is, and has been for the preceding five years, 223 a member of the bar of Florida. Unless otherwise provided by

#### Page 8 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

v

PCB CVJS 11-\_\_\_

#### ORIGINAL

general law, no person is eligible for the office of county court judge unless the person is, and has been for the preceding five years, a member of the bar of Florida. Unless otherwise provided by general law, a person shall be eligible for election or appointment to the office of county court judge in a county having a population of 40,000 or less if the person is a member in good standing of the bar of Florida.

231 SECTION 9. Determination of number of judges.-The supreme 232 courts court shall establish by rule uniform criteria for the 233 determination of the need for additional judges except supreme 234 court justices, the necessity for decreasing the number of 235 judges and for increasing, decreasing or redefining appellate 236 districts and judicial circuits. If the supreme courts jointly 237 find <del>court finds</del> that a need exists for increasing or decreasing 238 the number of judges or increasing, decreasing or redefining 239 appellate districts and judicial circuits, they it shall, prior 240 to the next regular session of the legislature, certify to the 241 legislature their its findings and recommendations concerning 242 such need. Upon receipt of such certificate, the legislature, at 243 the next regular session, shall consider the findings and 244 recommendations and may reject the recommendations or by law 245 implement the recommendations in whole or in part; provided the 246 legislature may create more judicial offices than are 247 recommended by the supreme court or may decrease the number of 248 judicial offices by a greater number than recommended by the 249 court only upon a finding of two-thirds of the membership of 250 both houses of the legislature, that such a need exists. A 251 decrease in the number of judges shall be effective only after

#### Page 9 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

V

PCB CVJS 11-

#### ORIGINAL

252 the expiration of a term. If the supreme courts fail <del>court fails</del> 253 to make findings as provided above when need exists, the 254 legislature may by concurrent resolution request the courts 255 court to jointly certify their its findings and recommendations 256 and upon the failure of the courts court to certify their its 257 findings for nine consecutive months, the legislature may, upon 258 a finding of two-thirds of the membership of both houses of the 259 legislature that a need exists, increase or decrease the number 260 of judges or increase, decrease or redefine appellate districts and judicial circuits. 261

262

SECTION 11. Vacancies.-

263 Whenever a vacancy occurs in a judicial office to (a) which election for retention applies, the governor shall fill 264 the vacancy by appointing for a term ending on the first Tuesday 265 266 after the first Monday in January of the year following the next 267 general election occurring at least one year after the date of 268 appointment, one of not fewer than three persons nor more than 269 six persons nominated by the appropriate judicial nominating 270 commission.

271 (b) The governor shall fill each vacancy on a circuit 272 court or on a county court, wherein the judges are elected by a 273 majority vote of the electors, by appointing for a term ending 274 on the first Tuesday after the first Monday in January of the 275 year following the next primary and general election occurring 276 at least one year after the date of appointment, one of not 277 fewer than three persons nor more than six persons nominated by 278 the appropriate judicial nominating commission. An election

## Page 10 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

PCB CVJS 11-\_\_\_

#### ORIGINAL

279 shall be held to fill that judicial office for the term of the 280 office beginning at the end of the appointed term.

(c) The nominations shall be made within thirty days from
the occurrence of a vacancy unless the period is extended by the
governor for a time not to exceed thirty days. The governor
shall make the appointment within sixty days after the
nominations have been certified to the governor.

There shall be a separate judicial nominating 286 (d)287 commission as provided by general law, one for the supreme courts court, one for each district court of appeal, and one for 288 289 each judicial circuit for all trial courts within the circuit. 290 Uniform rules of procedure shall be established by the judicial 291 nominating commissions at each level of the court system. Such 292 rules, or any part thereof, may be repealed by general law 293 enacted by a majority vote of the membership of each house of 294 the legislature, or by a majority vote of justices of the 295 supreme courts court, five justices concurring. Except for 296 deliberations of the judicial nominating commissions, the 297 proceedings of the commissions and their records shall be open 298 to the public.

299

SECTION 12. Discipline; removal and retirement.-

300 (a) JUDICIAL QUALIFICATIONS COMMISSION.—A judicial301 qualifications commission is created.

(1) There shall be a judicial qualifications commission
vested with jurisdiction to investigate and recommend to the
supreme court of criminal appeals Supreme Court of Florida the
removal from office of any justice or judge whose conduct,
during term of office or otherwise occurring on or after

#### Page 11 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

V

#### ORIGINAL

307 November 1, 1966, (without regard to the effective date of this 308 section) demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office, and to 309 investigate and recommend the discipline of a justice or judge whose conduct, during term of office or otherwise occurring on 310 311 or after November 1, 1966 (without regard to the effective date 312 of this section), warrants such discipline. For purposes of this 313 section, discipline is defined as any or all of the following: 314 reprimand, fine, suspension with or without pay, or lawyer 315 discipline. The commission shall have jurisdiction over justices 316 and judges regarding allegations that misconduct occurred before 317 or during service as a justice or judge if a complaint is made 318 no later than one year following service as a justice or judge. 319 The commission shall have jurisdiction regarding allegations of 320 incapacity during service as a justice or judge. The commission 321 shall be composed of:

a. Two judges of district courts of appeal selected by the
judges of those courts, two circuit judges selected by the
judges of the circuit courts and two judges of county courts
selected by the judges of those courts;

b. Four electors who reside in the state, who are members
of the bar of Florida, and who shall be chosen by the governing
body of the bar of Florida; and

329 c. Five electors who reside in the state, who have never 330 held judicial office or been members of the bar of Florida, and 331 who shall be appointed by the governor.

332 (2) The members of the judicial qualifications commission
333 shall serve staggered terms, not to exceed six years, as
334 prescribed by general law. No member of the commission except a

# Page 12 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

ORIGINAL

judge shall be eligible for state judicial office while acting as a member of the commission and for a period of two years thereafter. No member of the commission shall hold office in a political party or participate in any campaign for judicial office or hold public office; provided that a judge may campaign for judicial office and hold that office. The commission shall elect one of its members as its chairperson.

342 (3) Members of the judicial qualifications commission not
343 subject to impeachment shall be subject to removal from the
344 commission pursuant to the provisions of Article IV, Section 7,
345 Florida Constitution.

346 The commission shall adopt rules regulating its (4) 347 proceedings, the filling of vacancies by the appointing 348 authorities, the disgualification of members, the rotation of 349 members between the panels, and the temporary replacement of 350 disqualified or incapacitated members. The commission's rules, 351 or any part thereof, may be repealed by general law enacted by a 352 majority vote of the membership of each house of the 353 legislature, or by the supreme court of criminal appeals, five 354 justices concurring. The commission shall have power to issue 355 subpoenas. Until formal charges against a justice or judge are 356 filed by the investigative panel with the clerk of the supreme 357 court of Florida all proceedings by or before the commission shall be confidential; provided, however, upon a finding of 358 359 probable cause and the filing by the investigative panel with 360 said clerk of such formal charges against a justice or judge 361 such charges and all further proceedings before the commission 362 shall be public.

### Page 13 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

v

#### ORIGINAL

(5) The commission shall have access to all information from all executive, legislative and judicial agencies, including grand juries, subject to the rules of the commission. At any time, on request of the speaker of the house of representatives or the governor, the commission shall make available all information in the possession of the commission for use in consideration of impeachment or suspension, respectively.

370 (b) PANELS.-The commission shall be divided into an 371 investigative panel and a hearing panel as established by rule 372 of the commission. The investigative panel is vested with the 373 jurisdiction to receive or initiate complaints, conduct investigations, dismiss complaints, and upon a vote of a simple 374 375 majority of the panel submit formal charges to the hearing 376 panel. The hearing panel is vested with the authority to receive 377 and hear formal charges from the investigative panel and upon a 378 two-thirds vote of the panel recommend to the supreme court of 379 criminal appeals the removal of a justice or judge or the 380 involuntary retirement of a justice or judge for any permanent 381 disability that seriously interferes with the performance of 382 judicial duties. Upon a simple majority vote of the membership 383 of the hearing panel, the panel may recommend to the supreme court of criminal appeals that the justice or judge be subject 384 385 to appropriate discipline.

386 (c) SUPREME COURT <u>OF CRIMINAL APPEALS</u>.—The supreme court 387 <u>of criminal appeals</u> shall receive recommendations from the 388 judicial qualifications commission's hearing panel.

389 (1) The supreme court <u>of criminal appeals</u> may accept,
 390 reject, or modify in whole or in part the findings, conclusions,

# Page 14 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

V

#### ORIGINAL

391 and recommendations of the commission and it may order that the 392 justice or judge be subjected to appropriate discipline, or be 393 removed from office with termination of compensation for willful or persistent failure to perform judicial duties or for other 394 395 conduct unbecoming a member of the judiciary demonstrating a 396 present unfitness to hold office, or be involuntarily retired for any permanent disability that seriously interferes with the 397 398 performance of judicial duties. Malafides, scienter or moral 399 turpitude on the part of a justice or judge shall not be 400 required for removal from office of a justice or judge whose 401 conduct demonstrates a present unfitness to hold office. After the filing of a formal proceeding and upon request of the 402 investigative panel, the supreme court of criminal appeals may 403 404 suspend the justice or judge from office, with or without compensation, pending final determination of the inquiry. 405

406 (2) The supreme court <u>of criminal appeals</u> may award costs
407 to the prevailing party.

(d) The power of removal conferred by this section shallbe both alternative and cumulative to the power of impeachment.

410 Notwithstanding any of the foregoing provisions of (e) this section, if the person who is the subject of proceedings by 411 412 the judicial qualifications commission is a justice of the 413 supreme court of criminal appeals, Florida all justices of such 414 court automatically shall be disqualified to sit as justices of 415 such court with respect to all proceedings therein concerning such person and the supreme court of civil appeals shall hear 416 417 the case for such purposes shall be composed of a panel consisting of the seven chief judges of the judicial circuits of 418

# Page 15 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

2011 PCB CVJS 11-\_\_ ORIGINAL 419 the state of Florida most senior in tenure of judicial office as 420 circuit judge. For purposes of determining seniority of such 421 circuit judges in the event there be judges of equal tenure in 422 judicial office as circuit judge the judge or judges from the 423 lower numbered circuit or circuits shall be deemed senior. In 424 the event any such chief circuit judge is under investigation by 425 the judicial qualifications commission or is otherwise 426 disqualified or unable to serve on the panel, the next most 427 senior chief circuit judge or judges shall serve in place of 428 such disqualified or disabled chief circuit judge. 429 (f) SCHEDULE TO SECTION 12.-430 Except to the extent inconsistent with the provisions (1)of this section, all provisions of law and rules of court in 431 force on the effective date of this article shall continue in 432 433 effect until superseded in the manner authorized by the 434 constitution. 435 (2)After this section becomes effective and until adopted 436 by rule of the commission consistent with it: 437 The commission shall be divided, as determined by the a. 438 chairperson, into one investigative panel and one hearing panel 439 to meet the responsibilities set forth in this section. The investigative panel shall be composed of: 440 b. 441 1. Four judges, 442 2. Two members of the bar of Florida, and 443 3. Three non-lawyers. 444 The hearing panel shall be composed of: с. 445 1. Two judges, Two members of the bar of Florida, and 446 2.

# Page 16 of 33

### Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

ORIGINAL

2011

447

3. Two non-lawyers.

d. Membership on the panels may rotate in a manner
determined by the rules of the commission provided that no
member shall vote as a member of the investigative and hearing
panel on the same proceeding.

452 e. The commission shall hire separate staff for each453 panel.

454 f. The members of the commission shall serve for staggered 455 terms of six years.

456 g. The terms of office of the present members of the 457 judicial qualifications commission shall expire upon the 458 effective date of the amendments to this section approved by the 459 legislature during the regular session of the legislature in 460 1996 and new members shall be appointed to serve the following 461 staggered terms:

462 1. Group I.—The terms of five members, composed of two 463 electors as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, one member 464 of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article 465 V, one judge from the district courts of appeal and one circuit 466 judge as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V, shall expire 467 on December 31, 1998.

Group II.-The terms of five members, composed of one 468 2. 469 elector as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, two members 470 of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b. of Article 471 V, one circuit judge and one county judge as set forth in s. 472 12(a)(1)a. of Article V shall expire on December 31, 2000. 473 Group III.-The terms of five members, composed of two 3. electors as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)c. of Article V, one member 474

### Page 17 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

PCB CVJS 11-ORIGINAL 2011 475 of the bar of Florida as set forth in s. 12(a)(1)b., one judge from the district courts of appeal and one county judge as set 476 477 forth in s. 12(a)(1)a. of Article V, shall expire on December 478 31, 2002. 479 h. An appointment to fill a vacancy of the commission 480 shall be for the remainder of the term. 481 i. Selection of members by district courts of appeal 482 judges, circuit judges, and county court judges, shall be by no 483 less than a majority of the members voting at the respective 484 courts' conferences. Selection of members by the board of 485 governors of the bar of Florida shall be by no less than a 486 majority of the board. The commission shall be entitled to recover the costs 487 i. 488 of investigation and prosecution, in addition to any penalty 489 levied by the supreme court hearing the case. 490 k. The compensation of members and referees shall be the 491 travel expenses or transportation and per diem allowance as 492 provided by general law. 493 SECTION 15. Attorneys; admission and discipline.-The 494 supreme court of civil appeals shall have exclusive jurisdiction 495 to regulate the admission of persons to the practice of law and 496 the discipline of persons admitted. SECTION 21. Schedule to Article V amendment creating a 497 498 supreme court of civil appeals and a supreme court of criminal 499 appeals.-500 (a) Except to the extent inconsistent with the provisions 501 of this article, all provisions of law and rules of court in 502 force on the effective date of this article shall continue in

### Page 18 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

V

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 20  | )11      |
|-----|--|----------|
| 503 | effect until superseded in the manner authorized by the          |          |
| 504 | constitution.  |          |
| 505 | (b) The effective date of the amendment creating the             |          |
| 506 | supreme court of criminal appeals and supreme court of civil     |          |
| 507 | appeals shall be upon passage by the electorate.                 |          |
| 508 | (1) On the first day after the election approving the            |          |
| 509 | amendment, the supreme court shall rank all of the justices the  | <u>n</u> |
| 510 | in office by seniority. The three who have the most seniority    |          |
| 511 | shall be the initial justices of the supreme court of criminal   |          |
| 512 | appeals, and the remaining justices shall be the initial         |          |
| 513 | justices of the supreme court of civil appeals. Initial          |          |
| 514 | appointments of existing justices to either of the new supreme   |          |
| 515 | courts shall not be limited by the district court that the       |          |
| 516 | justice was appointed from. The supreme court shall immediately  | Y        |
| 517 | transmit to the Governor the names of those justices and the     |          |
| 518 | districts they were appointed from. The Governor shall direct    |          |
| 519 | the supreme court nominating commission to make its              |          |
| 520 | recommendations for the open seats of justices for the supreme   |          |
| 521 | court of civil appeals and for the supreme court of criminal     |          |
| 522 | appeals, which recommendations must be delivered to the governor | <u>r</u> |
| 523 | no later than the 45th day after the election. The governor      |          |
| 524 | shall make the appointments by the 60th day after the election.  |          |
| 525 | At the time of making the initial appointments the governor      |          |
| 526 | shall also designate the chief justices of each court, which     |          |
| 527 | appointment in this instance shall not be subject in the advice  |          |
| 528 | and consent of the senate.                                       |          |
| 529 | (2) The supreme court shall undertake to inventory all           |          |
| 530 | cases and case files in its possession and determine as to each  |          |
| 1   |  |          |

Page 19 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 201  |
|-----|---|
| 531 | case whether it is to be transferred to the supreme court of    |
| 532 | criminal appeals or the supreme court of civil appeals. Newly   |
| 533 | filed cases will be designated between the two new supreme      |
| 534 | courts. The supreme court shall retain full jurisdiction and    |
| 535 | power over cases in the inventory until actually transferred,   |
| 536 | including the power to issue final process which would have the |
| 537 | effect of removing the case from the inventory of cases to be   |
| 538 | transferred.  |
| 539 | (c) The supreme court of civil appeals and the supreme          |
| 540 | court of criminal appeals shall begin formal operations on the  |
| 541 | 120th day after the election. On that day:                      |
| 542 | (1) Newly appointed justices shall take office.                 |
| 543 | (2) The jurisdiction of the two supreme courts shall be         |
| 544 | divided.  |
| 545 | (3) The supreme court shall transfer all criminal cases to      |
| 546 | the supreme court of criminal appeals and shall transfer all    |
| 547 | civil cases to the supreme court of civil appeals.              |
| 548 | (4) The term of the supreme court shall be deemed to have       |
| 549 | ended. All mandates issued by the supreme court prior to the    |
| 550 | end of the term shall be final and not subject to recall.       |
| 551 | (d) Prior supreme court precedent shall be accorded             |
| 552 | appropriate respect by the supreme court of civil appeals and   |
| 553 | the supreme court of criminal appeals under the common law      |
| 554 | doctrine of stare decisis.                                      |
| 555 | (e) Until the jurisdiction of the supreme court of civil        |
| 556 | appeals is provided in general law, the supreme court of civil  |
| 557 | appeals:  |

# Page 20 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11       | ORIGINAL  | 2011      |
|-----|-------------------|---|-----------|
| 558 | (1)               | Shall hear appeals from decisions of district courts  | 3         |
| 559 |                   | declaring invalid a state statute or a provision of   | -         |
| 560 |                   | constitution, unless such appeal is within the        |           |
| 561 | jurisdicti        | on of the supreme court of criminal appeals.          |           |
| 562 | (2)               | When provided by general law, shall hear appeals fro  | om        |
| 563 | final judg        | ments entered in proceedings for the validation of    |           |
| 564 | bonds or c        | ertificates of indebtedness and shall review action   | of        |
| 565 | statewide         | agencies relating to rates or service of utilities    |           |
| 566 | providing         | electric, gas, or telephone service.                  |           |
| 567 | (3)               | May review any decision of a district court of appea  | <u>11</u> |
| 568 | that expre        | essly declares valid a state statute, or that express | sly       |
| 569 | construes         | a provision of the state or federal constitution, or  | £         |
| 570 | that expre        | essly affects a class of constitutional or state      |           |
| 571 | officers,         | or that expressly and directly conflicts with a       |           |
| 572 | <u>decision</u> o | of another district court of appeal, of the former    |           |
| 573 | supreme co        | ourt, or of the supreme court of civil appeals on the | 2         |
| 574 | <u>same quest</u> | ion of law, unless such appeal is within the          |           |
| 575 | jurisdicti        | on of the supreme court of criminal appeals.          |           |
| 576 | (4)               | May review any decision of a district court of appea  | 11        |
| 577 | that passe        | es upon a question certified by it to be of great     |           |
| 578 | public imp        | oortance, or that is certified by it to be in direct  |           |
| 579 | <u>conflict</u> w | with a decision of another district court of appeal,  |           |
| 580 | <u>unless suc</u> | ch appeal is within the jurisdiction of the supreme   |           |
| 581 | <u>court of c</u> | riminal appeals.                                      | . "       |
| 582 | (5)               | May review any order or judgment of a trial court     |           |
| 583 | certified         | by the district court of appeal in which an appeal i  | is        |
| 584 | pending to        | be of great public importance, or to have a great     |           |
| 585 | effect on         | the proper administration of justice throughout the   |           |
| I   |                   | Dega 91 of 99   |           |

# Page 21 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|-----|--|
| 586 | state, and certified to require immediate resolution by the      |
| 587 | supreme court, unless such appeal is within the jurisdiction of  |
| 588 | the supreme court of criminal appeals.                           |
| 589 | (6) May review a question of law certified by the Supreme        |
| 590 | Court of the United States or a United States Court of Appeals   |
| 591 | which is determinative of the cause and for which there is no    |
| 592 | controlling precedent of the former supreme court of Florida or  |
| 593 | of the supreme court of civil appeals, unless such question is   |
| 594 | within the jurisdiction of the supreme court of criminal         |
| 595 | appeals.   |
| 596 | (7) May issue writs of prohibition to courts and all writs       |
| 597 | necessary to the complete exercise of its jurisdiction, unless   |
| 598 | the writ is within the jurisdiction of the supreme court of      |
| 599 | criminal appeals.  |
| 600 | (8) May issue writs of mandamus and quo warranto to state        |
| 601 | officers and state agencies, unless the writ is within the       |
| 602 | jurisdiction of the supreme court of criminal appeals.           |
| 603 | (9) May, or any justice may, issue writs of habeas corpus        |
| 604 | returnable before the supreme court of civil appeals or any      |
| 605 | justice thereof, a district court of appeal or any judge         |
| 606 | thereof, or any circuit judge. Neither the supreme court of      |
| 607 | civil appeals nor any justice of the supreme court of civil      |
| 608 | appeals shall issue a writ of habeas corpus regarding any person |
| 609 | under a sentence of death, any person imprisoned for commission  |
| 610 | of a crime, or any person jailed facing criminal charges.        |
| 611 | (10) Shall, when requested by the attorney general               |
| 612 | pursuant to the provisions of Section 10 of Article IV, and if   |

# Page 22 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|        | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |  |
|--------|--|--|
| 613    | related to a civil matter, render an advisory opinion of the     |  |
| 614    | justices, addressing issues as provided by general law.          |  |
| 615    | (11) Shall have no jurisdiction or authority, whether            |  |
| 616    | express or implied, to issue a stay of execution or to hear any  |  |
| 617    | challenge of any law or procedure regarding the death penalty.   |  |
| 618    | (f) Until the jurisdiction of the supreme court of criminal      |  |
| 619    | appeals is provided by general law, the supreme court of         |  |
| 620    | criminal appeals:  |  |
| 621    | (1) Shall hear appeals from final judgments of trial             |  |
| 622    | courts imposing the death penalty.                               |  |
| 623    | (2) Shall hear appeals from decisions of district courts         |  |
| 624    | of appeal declaring invalid a state statute or a provision of    |  |
| 625    | the state constitution, in a criminal case.                      |  |
| 626    | (3) May review any decision of a district court of appeal        |  |
| 627    | that expressly declares valid a state statute, or that expressly |  |
| 628    | construes a provision of the state or federal constitution, or   |  |
| 629    | that expressly affects a class of constitutional or state        |  |
| 630    | officers, or that expressly and directly conflicts with a        |  |
| 631    | decision of another district court of appeal or of the supreme   |  |
| 632    | court on the same question of law, in a criminal case.           |  |
| 633    | (4) May review any decision of a district court of appeal        |  |
| 634    | that passes upon a question certified by it to be of great       |  |
| 635    | public importance, or that is certified by it to be in direct    |  |
| 636    | conflict with a decision of another district court of appeal, in |  |
| 637    | a criminal case.   |  |
| 638    | (5) May review any order or judgment of a trial court            |  |
| 639    | certified by the district court of appeal in which an appeal is  |  |
| 640    | pending to be of great public importance, or to have a great     |  |
| l<br>c | Page 23 of 33  |  |

۷

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|-----|--|
| 641 | effect on the proper administration of justice throughout the    |
| 642 | state, and certified to require immediate resolution by the      |
| 643 | court of criminal appeals, in a criminal case.                   |
| 644 | (6) May review a question of law certified by the Supreme        |
| 645 | Court of the United States or a United States Court of Appeals   |
| 646 | which is determinative of the cause and for which there is no    |
| 647 | controlling precedent of the former supreme court or the supreme |
| 648 | court of criminal appeals, in a criminal case.                   |
| 649 | (7) May issue writs of prohibition to courts and all writs       |
| 650 | necessary to the complete exercise of its jurisdiction, related  |
| 651 | to a criminal case.  |
| 652 | (8) May issue writs of mandamus and quo warranto to state        |
| 653 | officers and state agencies, related to a criminal case.         |
| 654 | (9) May, or any justice may, issue writs of habeas corpus        |
| 655 | returnable before the supreme court of criminal appeals or any   |
| 656 | justice thereof, a district court of appeal or any judge         |
| 657 | thereof, or any circuit judge. The power to issue a writ of      |
| 658 | habeas corpus under this sub-paragraph applies to any person     |
| 659 | under a sentence of death, any person imprisoned for commission  |
| 660 | of a crime, any person jailed facing criminal charges, or any    |
| 661 | person who cannot seek the writ from the supreme court of civil  |
| 662 | appeals because the supreme court of civil appeals lacks         |
| 663 | jurisdiction. Neither the supreme court of criminal appeals nor  |
| 664 | any justice of the supreme court of criminal appeals shall issue |
| 665 | a writ of habeas corpus regarding any person held in civil       |
| 666 | confinement.   |
| 667 | (10) Shall, when requested by the attorney general               |
| 668 | pursuant to the provisions of Section 10 of Article IV, and if   |

# Page 24 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 201   |
|-----|--|
| 669 | related to a criminal case, render an advisory opinion of the    |
| 670 | justices, addressing issues as provided by general law.          |
| 671 | (11) May hear any challenge to the constitutionality of the      |
| 672 | death penalty, any challenge to the method of carrying out the   |
| 673 | death penalty, or any request for a stay of a death penalty.     |
| 674 | (g) For purposes of interpreting the jurisdiction of the         |
| 675 | supreme court of civil appeals and the supreme court of the      |
| 676 | criminal appeals, until such jurisdiction is defined in general  |
| 677 | law:   |
| 678 | (1) The term "criminal case" shall be defined to mean any        |
| 679 | case or controversy primarily involving felonies, misdemeanors,  |
| 680 | criminal law, criminal penalties, criminal procedure, or any     |
| 681 | related action regarding the interpretation of or resolution of  |
| 682 | matters directly affecting the criminal law. Criminal cases are  |
| 683 | within the jurisdiction of the supreme court of criminal         |
| 684 | appeals.   |
| 685 | (2) A tort or contract case or controversy alleging civil        |
| 686 | damages resulting from criminal activity is not a criminal case. |
| 687 | (3) Confinement for the purpose of evaluation and treatment      |
| 688 | of a mentally ill person is not a criminal case unless the       |
| 689 | confinement is related to the commission of a criminal offense   |
| 690 | by an adult.   |
| 691 | (4) Confinement related to contempt of court is a civil          |
| 692 | case even if the contempt occurred during a criminal case.       |
| 693 | (5) Jurisdiction over juvenile delinquency shall be with         |
| 694 | the supreme court of civil appeals. In hearing such cases,       |
| 695 | supreme court of civil appeals shall abide by precedent of the   |
|     |  |
|     |  |

# Page 25 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011  |
|-----|--|
| 696 | supreme court of criminal appeals when determining whether the   |
| 697 | minor has committed a delinquent act.                            |
| 698 | (6) Equitable relief related to the criminal law, including      |
| 699 | where a party seeks to enjoin application of a criminal penalty, |
| 700 | shall be within the jurisdiction of the court of criminal        |
| 701 | appeals.   |
| 702 | (h) The Florida Rules of Criminal Procedure, as adopted and      |
| 703 | amended as of the date that the supreme court of criminal        |
| 704 | appeals begins operation, shall be in full force and effect as   |
| 705 | if adopted by the supreme court of criminal appeals, subject to  |
| 706 | amendment or repeal. The Florida Rules of Appellate Procedure,   |
| 707 | as amended and adopted as of the date that the supreme court of  |
| 708 | criminal appeals begins operation, shall apply in criminal       |
| 709 | appeals, subject to adoption by the court of criminal appeals of |
| 710 | appellate rules applicable to criminal appeals. All other court  |
| 711 | rules shall be in full force and effect as if adopted by the     |
| 712 | supreme court of civil appeals, subject to amendment or repeal.  |
| 713 | (i) The legislature may by general law otherwise provide         |
| 714 | for the administrative transfer of employees, property, duties   |
| 715 | and functions from the former supreme court to the supreme court |
| 716 | of civil appeals and the supreme court of criminal appeals.      |
| 717 | (j) The legislature shall have power, by concurrent              |
| 718 | resolution, to delete from this article any subsection of this   |
| 719 | section 21 including this subsection, when all events to which   |
| 720 | the subsection to be deleted is or could become applicable have  |
| 721 | occurred.  |
| 722 |  |

# Page 26 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

|     | PCB CVJS 11 ORIGINAL 2011   |
|-----|---|
| 723 | And that the following amendment to Section 2 of Article II         |
| 724 | of the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be submitted to    |
| 725 | the electors of this state for approval or rejection at the next    |
| 726 | general election or at an earlier special election specifically     |
| 727 | authorized by law for that purpose:                                 |
| 728 | ARTICLE II  |
| 729 | GENERAL PROVISIONS  |
| 730 | SECTION 2. Seat of governmentThe seat of government                 |
| 731 | shall be the City of Tallahassee, in Leon County, where the         |
| 732 | offices of the governor, lieutenant governor, cabinet members,      |
| 733 | supreme court of civil appeals, and the supreme court of            |
| 734 | criminal appeals shall be maintained and the sessions of the        |
| 735 | legislature shall be held; provided that, in time of invasion or    |
| 736 | grave emergency, the governor by proclamation may for the period    |
| 737 | of the emergency transfer the seat of government to another         |
| 738 | place.  |
| 739 |   |
| 740 | And that the following amendment to Section 17 of Article           |
| 741 | III of the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be             |
| 742 | submitted to the electors of this state for approval or             |
| 743 | rejection at the next general election or at an earlier special     |
| 744 | election specifically authorized by law for that purpose:           |
| 745 | ARTICLE III   |
| 746 | LEGISLATURE   |
| 747 | SECTION 17. Impeachment   |
| 748 | (a) The governor, lieutenant governor, members of the               |
| 749 | cabinet, justices of <u>a</u> the supreme court, judges of district |
| 750 | courts of appeal, judges of circuit courts, and judges of county    |
| '   | Page 27 of 33 Supreme Court PCB draft docx                          |

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

### ORIGINAL

751 courts shall be liable to impeachment for misdemeanor in office.
752 The house of representatives by two-thirds vote shall have the
753 power to impeach an officer. The speaker of the house of
754 representatives shall have power at any time to appoint a
755 committee to investigate charges against any officer subject to
756 impeachment.

(b) An officer impeached by the house of representatives shall be disqualified from performing any official duties until acquitted by the senate, and, unless impeached, the governor may by appointment fill the office until completion of the trial.

761 All impeachments by the house of representatives shall (C) 762 be tried by the senate. The chief justice of the supreme court 763 of criminal appeals, or another justice of either supreme court designated by the chief justice of the supreme court of criminal 764 765 appeals, shall preside at the trial, except in a trial of the 766 chief justice of either supreme court, in which case the 767 governor shall preside. The senate shall determine the time for 768 the trial of any impeachment and may sit for the trial whether 769 the house of representatives be in session or not. The time 770 fixed for trial shall not be more than six months after the 771 impeachment. During an impeachment trial senators shall be upon 772 their oath or affirmation. No officer shall be convicted without 773 the concurrence of two-thirds of the members of the senate 774 present. Judgment of conviction in cases of impeachment shall 775 remove the offender from office and, in the discretion of the 776 senate, may include disqualification to hold any office of 777 honor, trust or profit. Conviction or acquittal shall not affect 778 the civil or criminal responsibility of the officer.

# Page 28 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

V

# ORIGINAL

2011

779 780 And that the following amendment to Sections 1 and 4 of 781 Article IV of the State Constitution is agreed to and shall be submitted to the electors of this state for approval or 782 783 rejection at the next general election or at an earlier special 784 election specifically authorized by law for that purpose: 785 ARTICLE IV 786 EXECUTIVE 787 SECTION 1. Governor.-788 The supreme executive power shall be vested in a (a) 789 governor, who shall be commander-in-chief of all military forces 790 of the state not in active service of the United States. The 791 governor shall take care that the laws be faithfully executed, 792 commission all officers of the state and counties, and transact 793 all necessary business with the officers of government. The 794 governor may require information in writing from all executive 795 or administrative state, county or municipal officers upon any 796 subject relating to the duties of their respective offices. The 797 governor shall be the chief administrative officer of the state 798 responsible for the planning and budgeting for the state. 799 The governor may initiate judicial proceedings in the (b) 800 name of the state against any executive or administrative state, 801 county or municipal officer to enforce compliance with any duty 802 or restrain any unauthorized act. 803 The governor may request in writing the opinion of the (C) justices of the appropriate the supreme court as to the 804 805 interpretation of any portion of this constitution upon any

Page 29 of 33

question affecting the governor's executive powers and duties.

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

806

V

### ORIGINAL

807 The justices shall, subject to their rules of procedure, permit 808 interested persons to be heard on the questions presented and 809 shall render their written opinion not earlier than ten days 810 from the filing and docketing of the request, unless in their 811 judgment the delay would cause public injury.

(d) The governor shall have power to call out the militia
to preserve the public peace, execute the laws of the state,
suppress insurrection, or repel invasion.

(e) The governor shall by message at least once in each
regular session inform the legislature concerning the condition
of the state, propose such reorganization of the executive
department as will promote efficiency and economy, and recommend
measures in the public interest.

(f) When not otherwise provided for in this constitution, the governor shall fill by appointment any vacancy in state or county office for the remainder of the term of an appointive office, and for the remainder of the term of an elective office if less than twenty-eight months, otherwise until the first Tuesday after the first Monday following the next general election.

827

SECTION 4. Cabinet.-

(a) There shall be a cabinet composed of an attorney
general, a chief financial officer, and a commissioner of
agriculture. In addition to the powers and duties specified
herein, they shall exercise such powers and perform such duties
as may be prescribed by law. In the event of a tie vote of the
governor and cabinet, the side on which the governor voted shall
be deemed to prevail.

### Page 30 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V

#### ORIGINAL

835 (b) The attorney general shall be the chief state legal officer. There is created in the office of the attorney general 836 the position of statewide prosecutor. The statewide prosecutor 837 838 shall have concurrent jurisdiction with the state attorneys to prosecute violations of criminal laws occurring or having 839 840 occurred, in two or more judicial circuits as part of a related 841 transaction, or when any such offense is affecting or has affected two or more judicial circuits as provided by general 842 law. The statewide prosecutor shall be appointed by the attorney 843 844 general from not less than three persons nominated by the 845 judicial nominating commission for the supreme courts court, or 846 as otherwise provided by general law.

847 (c) The chief financial officer shall serve as the chief
848 fiscal officer of the state, and shall settle and approve
849 accounts against the state, and shall keep all state funds and
850 securities.

(d) The commissioner of agriculture shall have supervision
of matters pertaining to agriculture except as otherwise
provided by law.

(e) The governor as chair, the chief financial officer,
and the attorney general shall constitute the state board of
administration, which shall succeed to all the power, control,
and authority of the state board of administration established
pursuant to Article IX, Section 16 of the Constitution of 1885,
and which shall continue as a body at least for the life of
Article XII, Section 9(c).

861 (f) The governor as chair, the chief financial officer,862 the attorney general, and the commissioner of agriculture shall

### Page 31 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx

CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words underlined are additions.

v

2011 PCB CVJS 11-ORIGINAL 8631 constitute the trustees of the internal improvement trust fund 864 and the land acquisition trust fund as provided by law. 865 (q) The governor as chair, the chief financial officer, 866 the attorney general, and the commissioner of agriculture shall 867 constitute the agency head of the Department of Law Enforcement. 868 869 BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the following statement be 870 placed on the ballot: 871 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT 872 ARTICLE II, SECTION 2 873 ARTICLE III, SECTION 17 874 ARTICLE IV, SECTION 1 875 ARTICLE V, SECTIONS 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 15 AND 21 876 SUPREME COURT.-Proposing an amendment to the State 877 Constitution to create a supreme court of criminal appeals and a 878 supreme court of criminal appeals. Under current law, the 879 Florida Supreme Court, consisting of 7 appointed justices, is 880 the highest court in Florida, hearing both civil and criminal 881 cases. This resolution would abolish the current Supreme Court 882 and create a new supreme court of civil appeals and a new supreme court of criminal appeals. Each of the new supreme 883 884 courts would have 5 appointed justices. The 3 most senior 885 justices of the Florida Supreme Court would be transferred to 886 the new supreme court of criminal appeals, the remaining 4 887 current justices of the Florida Supreme Court would be 888 transferred to the new supreme court of civil appeals, and the Governor will have to appoint 3 new justices to fill in openings 889 890 in the 2 courts. The existing constitution creates the

## Page 32 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

# ORIGINAL

891 jurisdiction of the Supreme Court, which jurisdiction can only 892 be changed by constitutional amendment. This proposed amendment 893 splits the jurisdiction between the two supreme courts to 894 provide that the supreme court of civil appeals will have 895 jurisdiction over civil matters, and the supreme court of 896 criminal appeals will have jurisdiction over criminal matters. 897 The amendment also provides that the jurisdictions of the 898 supreme courts will be set in general law in the future and thus 899 may be changed by general law in the future. The power of these 900 new courts to issue a writ of habeas corpus is limited by this 901 amendment. Currently, the Florida Supreme Court has jurisdiction 902 over judicial discipline and the regulation of attorneys; this 903 amendment places jurisdiction over judicial discipline with the 904 supreme court of criminal appeals and jurisdiction over attorney 905 regulation with the supreme court of civil appeals. The proposed 906 amendment also creates a position of chief justice in each of 907 the supreme courts, removes the positions of clerk and marshal from the constitution, provides for transition, and makes 908 909 conforming changes in various sections of the constitution.

#### Page 33 of 33

Supreme Court PCB draft.docx CODING: Words stricken are deletions; words <u>underlined</u> are additions.

V